

MIROŚLAWA PODHAJECKA
University of Opole

REMARKS ON THE DOCUMENTATION IN OED3: COOKING TERMS AS A TEST CASE*

The aim of this paper is to demonstrate how the description of cooking terms in the third edition of the *Oxford English Dictionary* (OED3) can be improved with the massive dataset of Google Books. The paper, which can be treated as a case study, summarizes the research results offered to OED3's lexicographers, explaining which findings were taken into the dictionary and which were left behind. It also suggests additional evidence that is likely to update the treatment of the headwords.

1. Introduction

This paper looks at the documentation in the third edition of the *Oxford English Dictionary* (henceforth, OED3), a monumental historical dictionary of English. While the first (OED1) and the second (OED2) edition of the dictionary came to be investigated by a number of researchers (e.g. Schäfer 1980, 1989; Willinsky 1994; McConchie 1997; Brewer 2007), studies on the third edition have so far mirrored mainly the lexicographers' experience (e.g. Durkin 2002, 2004; Simpson 2004; Simpson, Weiner and Durkin 2004; Gilliver 2005; Weiner 2009). The new edition, still in the making, has been one of the largest and most ambitious lexicographic projects today claimed to be “the definitive record of the English language”, but there are reasons to believe that it should also be examined systematically to point out omissions and inconsistencies (cf. ten Hacken 2012).

My research, based on the premise that Google Books can be successfully “harnessed” for lexicological and lexicographic purposes (Podhajecka 2011: 530), was conducted originally in 2010. It grew into a paper presented at the Fifth

* I would like to gratefully acknowledge the help of Dr. John Simpson, the former Chief Editor of OED3, who commented kindly both on my findings and research problems. All possible mistakes are obviously my own.

International Conference on Historical Lexicography and Lexicology held at St. Ann's College, Oxford (16-18 June 2010), which marked the tenth anniversary of *OED Online* (OED3). This paper focuses on the extent to which the research influenced the treatment of cooking terms in OED3, offering threads of evidence which seem strong enough to further improve the description of the headwords.

The *Oxford English Dictionary* has always welcomed contributions from the general public. In his capacity as Chief Editor of OED3, Simpson underlined in one of his interviews (2011):

The public have always been involved in the OED roughly from the beginning of the 1850s. The collection of this amount of documentary evidence can't just be done by the editorial staff alone, and the public know things that we don't, so if we can encourage the general public to send in information to us (...) then it makes the dictionary much stronger.

When complete, my database was sent to Oxford in the hope that it might help establish the dating of the cooking terms and I am proud to say that many of my findings are now incorporated into OED3 (see Appendix 2). This has given me a unique opportunity to look back at the results of my research from the perspective of OED3's working practice.

2. Materials and methods

Cooking seemed a timely topic, insofar as "the culinary appetites of the English-speaking world grow ever more diverse, loan words referring to new cuisines are a perennial source of new *OED* entries (...) Dishes from the English-speaking world are also in evidence, with new entries for the classic English dessert *Eton mess*, the American *doughnut hole*, and that emblem of West Coast US sushi culture, the *California roll*".¹ The changes in the English vocabulary of cooking have indeed been confirmed by my research sample, 40% of which are newly added headwords.

The cooking terms come from OED3's alphabet range revised by 2010 (M-R). They were extracted from the online version of the dictionary by means of the 'search in definition' function, the label *Cookery* having been treated as the query keyword. Since the bulk of Google Books sources comes from the late eighteenth century, I only took into account post-1750 headwords or senses. In line with the criteria adopted, 95 headwords or senses constituted my research sample (see Appendix 1). OED3's documentation material was then checked against Google Books; the search for antedatings was treated as essential in my research, but I paid attention to different aspects of lexicographic description.

¹ The passage is quoted from the OED website presenting the March 2011 update at <http://public.oed.com/the-oed-today/recent-updates-to-the-oed/previous-updates/march-2011-update/>.

Many of the citations collected from Google Books were found in cookery books, such as *The French Cook* (1822), *The Cook's Dictionary* (1833) or *The Complete Modern Cook* (1834), which had always been selling in large numbers. However, useful and even illuminating material was collected from other text genres, such as journals or travel accounts. Any quaint or undated Google Books citations were verified in two major digital libraries: HathiTrust and the Internet Archive, which provided full-text access to a proportion of the sources. It needs to be added that all the searches conducted in 2010 were repeated in 2015 to bring the evidence up to date.

2.1. OED3

The third edition of the *Oxford English Dictionary* is based on OED2, which appeared first as a printed version (1989) and then an electronic one (1994). Soon afterwards, launching a new edition began to be discussed and, since 2000, the dictionary has been undergoing a complete top-to-bottom revision (for an outline, see, e.g., Simpson 2004: 198-207; Weiner 2009: 378-409). One has to admit that, in the era of the digital revolution, it was the only sensible decision which could rescue the dictionary from becoming a “magnificent fossil”, as Laski (qtd. in Ilson 1986: 17) pointed out far-sightedly. In a nutshell, the value of the new edition lies in its drawing on accumulated scholarship on the one hand and applying a far wider range of sources, including enormous databases, corpora and the World Wide Web, on the other one. Little wonder the revision has brought changes to practically every aspect of the dictionary microstructure and the wordlist too has grown – and is still growing – considerably.

2.2. Google Books

The basic aim of Google Books, an innovative project undertaken in 2005, is to make as much book content searchable online as possible without infringing copyright law. At present, Google Books embraces around 30 million books, which makes it the largest collection of (not only) English text available worldwide. In the standard version, it offers two types of sources: those in the public domain, which are available in their entirety, and those protected by copyright, available as text snippets (a few lines of text surrounding the search term).² Thanks to an interface developed by Mark Davies, Google Books is now treated as a fully-fledged corpus embracing two subcorpora of British English (34 billion words) and American English (155 billion words).

² The latter does not allow one to see the words in a broader context, which is a serious disadvantage to scholarly research. A description of the pitfalls of using Google Books can be found in Podhajecka (2011).

3. Updating OED3's documentation

Summarizing the results of my research, antedatings were found for 76 of the cooking terms, which accounts for 80% of the research sample, 48 of which (50.5%) were retrieved from full-text versions. Text snippets offering limited view provide less reliable evidence, all the more that the dating of Google Books sources is not infrequently wrong, but the pool of snippet antedatings does not have to be completely useless. OED3's editors succeeded, with the help of library researchers, in identifying the sources of the snippets, which shows that the passages for headwords such as *make-ahead*, *mizutaki* or *money bag* were both relevant and dated properly.

Antedatings were not found for 18 lemmas, mainly short and/or frequent word-forms (e.g. *pesto*, *pin*, *purse*, *reamer*), which came to be retrieved in thousands of hits. Despite applying various Boolean expressions to narrow the searches (e.g. "purse" AND "cream", "purse" AND "syrup" or "purse" AND "sauce"), the hits for the above words were most difficult to sift through.³

As could be expected, not all the data was regarded as fully suitable from the point of view of historical lexicography. Nevertheless, the editors decided to incorporate into the dictionary's database the antedatings for 56 headwords or senses (59%), in several cases taking more than one citation per entry. The exact data can be found in Appendix 2.

3.1. Antedatings and postdatings

The time-span of antedating is quite varied, covering from a few years (e.g. *petite marmite* 1900 > 1890) to over 100 years (*medallion* 1907 > 1806). This is a clear-cut proof that Google Books is an invaluable collection of citations that can push back the first recorded usages of OED3's headwords. Moreover, for some headwords I identified more than one illustrative example predating OED3's first date of appearance, so the lexicographers could choose those which presented the cooking term in the most informative context. A sample of my antedatings database is displayed in Table 1 below.

³ It seems something of a paradox that the richer the database is, the more difficult it is to find particular evidence for a particular search term.

Table 1. A sample of the antedatings database

Headword	Antedated from > to	Antedating citation
nam prik	1897 > 1857	A sauce called nam-phrik is used by all classes in Siam. It is prepared by bruising a quantity of red pepper in a mortar: <i>The Kingdom and People of Siam</i> (p. 108)
olykoek	1809 > 1795	I think you had better stay at home and mind your studies, or come and eat <i>kifkatoma nuts</i> and oly-cooks at my fire side: <i>The New-York Magazine</i> , 6 (p. 26)
pasta	1874 > 1827	It consists of a large quantity of bread, in which case only it is called soup, <i>zuppa</i> ; or of pasta , that is macaroni, vermicelli, or some similar paste: <i>Two Hundred and Nine Days</i> (p. 339)
raclette	1949 > 1914	This is what is called a raclette ; and it is very good, accompanied with wine: <i>Unknown Switzerland: Reminiscences of Travel</i> (p. 276)

A number of postdatings were also available for a majority of the headwords, even though antedatings were much harder to find. Since the last quotations for *make-ahead* (noun) and *make-ahead* (adjective) in OED3 are dated to 1971 and 1998 respectively, Table 2 displays potential postdatings for both parts of speech.

Table 2. Antedatings for *make-ahead* (adjective and noun)

Headword	Postdated from > to	Postdating citation
make-ahead (noun)	1971 > 2003	With this simple collection of recipes, you'll find everything you need – from the easy to make-aheads , family favorites, and scrumptious festive cookies for entertaining: <i>Homemade Christmas Cookies</i> (p. 4)
	1971 > 2006	As you look over potential recipes, select a few that are make-aheads , specifically those that don't require any additional preparation other than heating up or taking out of the freezer: <i>The All-New Complete Cooking Light Cookbook</i> (p. 23)
make-ahead (adjective)	1998 > 2008	This make-ahead dish goes well with roast chicken, turkey, ham or pork. Instead of apples, you can use 2 cups (500 ml) unsweetened applesauce: <i>Anne Lindsay's Light Kitchen</i> (p. 152)

Table 2.

	1998 > 2013	Although you could have this as a make-ahead dish because it takes 3 hours to cook, you might want to have it as your reward on Cook Day instead: <i>Week in a Day</i> (p. 2)
--	-------------	--

Serendipity also played a role: I sometimes coincidentally came across evidence for other words, such as *biryani*, a cross-reference in the entry for *nasi beryani*.⁴ The lemma, with the first recorded occurrence in 1932, can now be antedated to 1856.

Table 3. Antedatings for *biryani*, a cross-reference to the search term *nasi beryani*

Headword	Antedated from > to	Antedating citation
biryani	1932 > 1856	These being removed, we dipped hands in “ Biryani ,” a meat pillaw, abounding in clarified butter: <i>Personal Narrative of a Pilgrimage to El-Madinah and Meccah</i> (p. 477)
	1932 > 1884	The rich give costly public dinners at which the chief dishes are <i>biryani</i> and <i>jarda</i> . Biryani is a dish of mutton, clarified butter, rice, cardamoms, cloves, black pepper, cinnamon, and fresh ginger or saffron; <i>jarda</i> is a sweet dish of rice, clarified butter, sugar, almonds, saffron, and other spices: <i>Gazetteer of the Bombay Presidency</i> 21 (p. 197)
	1932 > 1921	Bir̄yānī , ‘fry’, is made with marrow, plenty of spices, lime, cream, and milk...: <i>Islam in India: or, the Qānūn-i-Islām; the Customs of the Musalmāns of India; Comprising a Full and Exact Account of Their Various Rites and Ceremonies from the Moment of Birth to the Hour of Death</i> (p. 320)

The same goes for *pâté*, whose sense ‘a rich paste or spread made from finely minced and seasoned meat, fish, or vegetables, usually cooked in a terrine and served cold’ (OED3 1890) has been cross-referenced to *pâté de foie gras*, a formally and semantically related headword. As has turned out, one of my

⁴ *Nasi beryani* (OED3 1963) can be further antedated to 1962: “Unique foods to try: satay, variety of meats on bamboo skewers grilled over charcoal, served with chili-peanut sauce, eaten off the skewer; chicken in the coconut, uniquely spiced stew served in a basket; *nasi beryani*, *chicken or mutton*-based turmeric rice”: *Pacific Hotels and Transportation Services* (p. 122).

antedatings originally collected for *pâté* served OED3's lexicographers as the earliest attestation for *pâté de foie gras*.⁵

Google Books includes multilingual text which can tell us something about the currency of the cooking terms in other languages. To provide a specific example, *rassolnik* (OED3 1899), a Russian loanword, was borrowed into French a few decades earlier, as shown by sources like *La cuisine classique études pratiques ...* (1856) or *La Gastronomie en Russie* (1860), whereas *nassi goreng* (OED3 1924), a word of Malay provenience, was attested in German as early as 1839 (*Das Ausland: Eine Wochenschrift...*).

3.2. Spelling variants

Variation in form has always been given much attention by the OED's editors, as indicated by strings of diachronically arranged word-forms. However, as results from my analysis, even more spelling variants could be added to OED3 with the proviso that they may not have gained wide recognition (cf. Table 4). The spellings *Rusolnik* and *russolnik* (OED3 *rassolnik*), available in Google Books with a single occurrence each, can be treated as a case in point.

Table 4. New spelling variants found in Google Books

OED3's headword	A new spelling
madeleine	madelaine
medallion	medalion
nasi	nassi
nasi goreng	nassi goreng / nasi goring
olykoek	oily cake
pain au chocolat	pain an chocolat
pain de campagne	pan de campagne
poffertje	pufferties
rassolnik	rosolnik / rossolnik

The most unusual of the above-mentioned spellings is *oily cake*, which resembles an English calque rather than the original Dutch name. Since its status was enigmatic, OED3's lexicographers decided to treat the passage in which it was used as a square-bracketed citation:⁶ "This dog, who had been taught

⁵ It reads as follows: "The dinner was in the first stile, and among the luxuries were *pâtés de foie gras*, a dish fit for Heliogabalus himself. It is composed of the livers of geese, and truffles": *Narrative of a Forced Journey through Spain and France* (1814, p. 124-125).

⁶ It is a citation which includes a lexical antecedent of the headword and which is therefore put into square brackets.

to fetch and carry, we used to go out with, furnished with *oily cakes*, to the town ditch, where we lay concealed, my husband and the dog on one side, I on the other in the weeds, till the smugglers came with horseloads of brandy, &c., and in small kegs”: *Novels and Miscellaneous Works: With Prefaces and Notes* (1724, p. 444). A reference to “the Low Countries” found earlier in the text must have been the main argument for doing so.

At the same time, one might wonder why the lexicographers ignored the other spellings, of which only *nassi goreng* was admitted into the dictionary. While *medalio* or *pain an chocolat* were apparently typographical mistakes and *nassi*, by contrast, was used in a non-English context, there are fewer reservations to the other variants attested in Google Books. *Madelaine*, for instance, is quite frequent, particularly in the plural form, and although some of its occurrences are in other languages or quite different meanings, there is sufficient diachronic documentation to prove that the spelling did come with the cooking sense (see Table 5).

Table 5. Occurrences for the variant *madelaine* unrecorded in OED3

New variant	Date	Interdating citation
madelaine	1832	MADELAINES EN SURPRISE. Make your <i>madelaines</i> in the usual way; when cold, cut a thin slice from the bottom, take out nearly all the inside: <i>The Cook's Dictionary</i> ... (p. 342)
	1885	MADELAINES . Take nine ounces of powder-sugar, eight of flour, the yolks of four and six whole eggs, two spoonfuls of brandy, and a grain of salt; put these into a saucepan, stirring continually...: <i>The Cook's Own Book</i> ... (p. 114)
	1904	Recipes for angel cake mixture and for Genoese mixture, and for <i>madelaines</i> are given on page 241 of the <i>Ten Shillings a Head</i> book: <i>The Single Handed Cook: More Recipes</i> (p. 184)
	1920	“I remember only that you made yourself ill eating <i>Madelaines</i> and had to be taken home en voiture,” Collier Pratt said quickly: <i>Outside Inn</i> (p. 200)
	2000	Scones, crumpets, shortbread cookies, and <i>Madelaines</i> are essential to a proper tea party and can be topped with sweet butter, clotted cream, lemon curds, and/or jams: <i>The Complete Idiot's Guide to Throwing a Great Party</i> (p. 145)

A few of the novel word-forms collected above have been displayed in Table 6 in their immediate contexts.

Table 6. Occurrences for variants of cooking terms unrecorded in OED3

OED3's headword	New variant	Interdating citation
poffertje	pufferties (<i>pl.</i>)	131. To make Dutch " Pufferties ": <i>The New Practice of Cookery, Pastry, Baking, and Preserving</i> (1804, p. 74)
masala	mussala	Prepare the same ground mussala as for Frithath Curry No. 196, grinding it in vinegar with ½ a tea spoon mustard seed: <i>Indian Cookery Local for Young Housekeepers</i> (1887, p. 71)
nasi	nassi	<i>On the Malay coast the rice has a similar diversity of names: in the husk the grain is called padi; divested of it, and boiled, it becomes nassi: Chamber's Edinburgh Journal</i> , 13 (1850, p. 206)
nasi goreng	nasi goring	At breakfast time it cleared – breakfast time was, of course, the first dim light of dawn – and what with a cheerful sunrise and an excellent dish of " Nasi goring ", browned rice, the day opened pleasantly: <i>East for Pleasure: The Narrative of Eight Months' Travel in Burma, Siam, the Netherlands East Indies and French Indo-China</i> (1929, p. 190)
rassolnik	rosolnik	Rosolnik is an excellent soup of cucumbers and other vegetables and fowl; no water is used in preparing it – the cucumber juice is enough: <i>The Nation: A weekly Journal Devoted to Politics, Literature, Science and Art</i> , 8 (1869, p. 8) ⁷
rassolnik	rossolnik	In England Bortch and Rossolnik , the latter a soup in which cucumber juice and parsley and celery roots play their parts, are the only Russian soups generally known: <i>The Gourmet's Guide to Europe</i> (1911, p. 380)

Analyzing OED3's entries one will come across some variability in form, e.g. *Maryland chicken* is accompanied by the variants *Maryland* and *chicken à la Maryland*, *mousseline* is a shortening of *mousseline sauce* / *sauce mousseline*, *naan* can replace *naan bread*, whereas *parsley* denotes *parsley green*.⁸ It is unclear, however, why other cooking terms in OED3 have not been documented

⁷ This citation antedates the earliest recorded occurrence now in OED3 (1899).

⁸ One can also find evidence that *parsley* was tantamount with *green parsley* (also in its plural form *parsley greens*), as illustrated by the following citation: "When boiled, it is usual to put in the water a few onions, cloves and a little nutmeg, with a bundle of sweet herbs, but no salt; and

based on the same pattern; for example, Google Books sources show consistently that *Napoletana* is otherwise called *Napoletana pizza*, *pizza Napoletana*, *pizza Napolitana* or *pizza a la Napolitana*.⁹ The entry for *Napoletana* does provide a variant spelling (*Napolitana*), but it is most probably related to the first meaning of the lemma accompanied by the label *Early Music*.¹⁰

In the case of the lemma *pithivier*, the spelling *Pithiviers cake* is treated in OED3 as the full form. However, Google Books provides two alternative variants, *Pithivier's cake* and *pithivier cake*, entered in an upper- and a lower-case letter respectively, which can also be found in OED3's citations. The same is observed in the entries for *nasi Padang* (*nasi padang*), *Napoletana* (*pizza napolitana*) and *Nonya* (*nonya*), whereby the variants spelled with lower-case letters are recorded in the citations paragraphs. This implies that the selection of the lemma, especially if there is strong historical evidence for more than one spelling variant, results from the lexicographers' normative decision.

3.3. Illustrative material

For a significant number of OED3's headwords, Google Books data confirms the lexicographers' treatment, but it occasionally offers a somewhat different perspective by bringing to the fore problematic and borderline cases. The main dilemma is how to document such idiosyncratic evidence in OED3 and based on what criteria. Let me display a few examples illustrating the research problem.

Montpellier butter is a cookery term dated to 1889 in OED3. The question at this juncture is whether *butter of Montpel(l)ier* (1822) should be allowed into the dictionary and, if so, under which headword it should be placed: *butter*, *Montpellier* or perhaps both.¹¹ Four potential antedatings are shown below.

after letting it stand to cool in the liquor, it is served up cold, with a garnish of green parsley": *The Family Receipt-Book* (ca.1810, p. 180).

⁹ The earliest occurrence of *Napoletana* has now been traced to 1884: "215. – *Pizza Napoletana*. Take some leavened dough, knead it well with a little oil and salt, adding at intervals a little grated Swiss cheese rather fresh. Spread the paste in a greased baking pan, prick the surface, sprinkle with grated cheese, and bake": *Maigre Cookery* (p. 84-85).

¹⁰ The meaning is obscure, all the more that the dictionary's cross-referencing structure has been rather unhelpful: the synonymous word-form *Villanella* is left undefined, while the analogue *Neapolitan* (a name introduced by 'cf.') is cross-referenced back to *Napoletana*.

¹¹ In fact, *The French Cook* of 1822 included both *butter of Montpelier* and *butter of Montpellier*. In Google Books historical sources, the frequency of the former is three times as low.

Table 7. Antedatings for *Montpellier butter* and its variant

Headword	Antedated from > to	Antedating citation
Montpellier butter	1889 > 1822	Butter of Montpellier. – Take a handful of chervil, tarragon, burnet, and green onions; wash them very clean, and blanch them in boiling water, with a handful of salt to keep them as green as possible: <i>The French Cook</i> (p. 279)
	1889 > 1822	No. 8. – Artichoke-bottoms en Canapés. THESE when cold, are served for <i>entremets</i> . Pour on the centre of each artichoke-bottom some anchovy butter, or Montpelier butter , and decorate the whole with capers, pickled cucumbers, beet-root &c. and when ready to serve up, pour over them a salad sauce, garnished with cresses between: <i>The French Cook</i> (p. 314)
	1889 > 1830	Take some Montpelier butter (either green or red) and spread it equally over two saucepanlids, laying it about three eighths of an inch in thickness: <i>The Cook's Dictionary, and House-Keeper's Directory ...</i> (p. 87)
	1889 > 1834	Montpellier Butter. Wash a large handful of chervil, about twenty sprigs of tarragon, the same quantity of pimpernel, and a pint of chives ; after draining the whole, put it in boiling water with some salt: <i>The Royal Parisian Pastrycook and Confectioner</i> (p. 227)

Montpellier butter, with a definition and five illustrative quotations in OED3, is included in the entry for *Montpellier* without any cross-reference to the entry for *butter*. The first citation in Table 7 has now been treated as a square bracketed citation, which is a reasonable decision. Interestingly, *Montpellier butter* is claimed to have been coloured green, but the 1830 citation refers to its red-coloured variant. The lexicographers must have found that information useful, as they took the antedating into OED3.

To provide another puzzling example, due to a change in the shape of the headword, should the first citation shown in Table 8 be treated as a square-bracketed citation or an antedating proper?

Table 8. Antedatings for *potato ball* and its variant

Headword	Antedated from > to	Antedating citation
potato ball	1823 > 1777	Potatoes in Balls. Do them as above; roll them in balls with a little flower, brown them in a common or Dutch oven, or fry them: <i>The Lady's Assistant for Regulating and Supplying Her Table</i> (p. 321)
	1823 > 1817	Savoury Potatoe Balls (No. 112.) Are made by adding a quarter of a pound of crated ham to a pound of mashed potatoes with the yolk of a couple of eggs, as in the last receipt: <i>Apicius Redivivus, or, The Cook's Oracle</i> (p. E4)
	1823 > 1822	Potatoe Balls. – (No. 111.) Mix mashed Potatoes with the yolk of an egg, roll them into balls, flour them, or egg and bread-crumbs them, and fry them in clean drippings, – or brown them in a Dutch oven: <i>The Cook's Oracle: Containing Receipts for Plain Cookery</i> (p. 210)

Table 9. Occurrences for *potatoes in balls*

Headword	Date	Interdating citation
potato ball	1810	Potatoes in Balls. Do them as above; roll them in balls with a little flour; brown them in a Dutch oven, or fry them: <i>The Female Economist</i> (p. 51)
	1866	POTATOES IN BALLS. – POMMES DE TERRE EN BOULETTES. Steam some potatoes. Peel them and pound them up. Add eggs, cream, salt, pepper, parsley, green onions, and nutmeg to them. Mix this to a well-mingled paste: <i>The Treasury of French Cookery</i> (p. 189)
	1926	Fillet of Fish, Garnished with Lemon and Parsley, Creamed Potatoes in Balls , Sweetbread Croquette, French Peas: <i>Philippine Magazine</i> , 23 (p. 411)

As has turned out, the first two passages for *potato ball* (under *potato*) were regarded as helpful: the 1777 one acquired the status of a square bracketed citation, whereas the 1817 one was treated as an antedating proper. It is a pity that the passage from *The Cook's Oracle* ... (1822) was left behind, because none of the citations in OED3 mentions potato balls rolled in bread-crumbs, which

required a modification of the original recipe. It may be instructive to note that the phrase *potatoes in balls* was documented first, diachronically speaking, but it continued to be used well into the twentieth century, as displayed in Table 9. To avoid mistakes, noun phrases following verbs such as *cut* (“cut potatoes”) or *shape* (“shape sweet potatoes”) were not taken into account in my Google Books queries.

The name *potatoes in balls*, as the 1866 quotation shows, may have come into use as a calque of the French phrase *pommes de terre en boulettes*. This notwithstanding, recently conducted searches provided me with two more lexical variants, *balled potatoes* and *balls of potatoes*. While the former is found solely in the recipe for ‘Mexican kid’ published in *Outdoor Cooking* of 1940 (“Brown pieces of you kid in olive oil, add 1 small onion (cut up), crushed garlic, balled potatoes, minced parsley, and sweet marjoram”, p. 15), the latter has been more frequent in Google Books sources, including *Paterson’s National Benefit ...* of 1872 (“Small Regent *balls of Potatoes* form an agreeable addition to open fish-pies”, p. 39) or *The Steward’s Handbook ...* of 1903 (“BRAISED GOOSE A L’ALSACIENNE (...) served with broiled sausages, boiled chestnuts in bouillon, and *balls of potatoes* fried, and gravy made of the braise liquor”, p. 331-332).

Parsley green ‘an extract of fresh parsley, formerly used to colour sauces, etc., in cookery’, with the first recorded usage in OED3 dated to 1845, is marked as obsolete. It seemed baffling to me that the phrase was quite frequent in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century sources. Yet, upon closer scrutiny, most of the occurrences were part of larger syntactic constructions, like “to have parsley green through the winter” or “to keep the parsley green and crisp”, or strings of noun phrases separated by a comma or a full stop (e.g. “a sliced onion, parsley, green onions”). This indicates that linguistic and textual interpretation is an integral part of searches in corpora and digital libraries. On the other hand, there are a few instances in Google Books which do not include the very term, but which describe the same or a comparable concept.

Table 10. Citations for *parsley* / *parsley green*

Headword	Antedated from > to	Antedating / interdating citation
parsley green	1845 > [1784]	The way it is used in colouring Cheese, is, take a piece of <i>Spanish-Annatto</i> , which appears in the form of a stone (...) Some use Parsley in the same manner, but that is not so much esteemed for flavour as Sage: <i>Dairying Exemplified, or, The Business of Cheese-Making</i> (p. 67)

Table 10.

	1845 > 1834	No. 19. Spinach Green. Take two or three handfuls of fresh spinach, thoroughly washed, pound it, and squeeze the juice through a cloth, as it discolours the tummy, and makes it unfit for delicate sauces. Put the juice in a stewpan on the fire with a little salt, stirring without leaving it (...) No. 20. Parsley Green . Is made absolutely as spinach green: <i>The Complete Modern Cook</i> ... (p. 16)
	1845 < 1866	406. INGREDIENTS.– 6 tablespoonfuls of Béchamel, No. 367, seasoning to taste of salt and cayenne a little parsley-green to colour, the juice of 1/2 a lemon: <i>How to Dine, Dinners & Dining</i> ... (p. 75)

It is particularly the 1834 citation, a brand-new discovery, which is not an antedating in the strict sense of the word, so its usefulness for OED3's citations paragraph is dubious.

3.4. Sense division

Sense discrimination in an historical dictionary has always been of utmost importance. It is therefore worthwhile looking at Google Books to find out whether there are any attestations which go beyond OED3's division of senses. I will discuss a couple of examples.

Mise en place is defined in OED3 as 'preparation, setting in place; (*Cookery*) the initial preparation of equipment and ingredients carried out in a restaurant kitchen prior to the commencement of cooking'. One might claim that a specific sense related to geology could be considered for inclusion in OED3; this is suggested by the following passage: "The mode of intrusion is implied in what precedes – a *mise en place* by progressive assimilation of the overlying terranes": *The Journal of Geology* (1898, p. 762). Still, as John Simpson explained (e-mail on 15 May 2010), "the initial definition is intentionally open, and in fact usefully covers the new evidence". There are more instances of such open definitions in OED3, which appears to be a convenient formula designed for future discoveries in the revision process.

Another loanword, *pasta*, occurs very frequently in Google Books in a variety of senses. In OED3, the meaning of the word was originally explained by what Kay and Wotherspoon (2002: 113) call a "compendious definition":¹²

¹² In OED2, *pasta* is defined as 'a generic name for various forms of Italian dough mixtures or 'pastes', as macaroni, spaghetti, vermicelli, etc. Also *attrib.* and *Comb.*'

pasta

Esp. in Italian cookery: thin strands, sheets, or other shapes of dough made from durum wheat and water (sometimes enriched with egg), freq. sold dried and usually cooked in boiling water; a dish of these, esp. one served with a sauce. Occas. as a count noun: a variety of pasta.

Judging by over nine million Google Books hits for *pasta*, I assumed that the meaning could be successfully separated into senses to more adequately reflect semantic nuances. It should not be surprising that the lexicographers did justice to the ever-increasing amount of data, in consequence of which the entry for *pasta* in OED3 (pronunciation, etymology and quotations excluded) now looks as follows:

pasta, *n.* 1

1. **a.** Esp. in Italian cookery: thin strands, sheets, or other shapes of dough made from durum wheat and water (sometimes enriched with egg), usu. sold dried, and cooked in boiling water. **b.** As a count noun: a variety of pasta.
2. A dish of these, esp. one served with a sauce.

Apart from that, the entry has citations for attributive compounds (e.g. *pasta products*) and objective ones (e.g. *the pasta-makers*), as well as for the adjectival derivative *pasta-like*.

Needless to say, meaning discrimination in the realm of historical lexicography is fraught with numerous challenges. One of them is that any investigation of rich documentation is bound to uncover atypical examples of usage (Simpson 2000). As indicated above, Google Books embraces not only the ‘perfect’ kind of linguistic evidence, but also ambiguous instances and counter-examples which may not be synthesized neatly into OED3’s entry (cf. Piotrowski 2009: 200). That some of the lexicographers are ‘lumpers’ (minimizing the number of senses), while others tend to be ‘splitters’ (multiplying senses) is another issue to deal with.

3.5. Intratextual reference

As already mentioned, OED3 records some shortened forms, e.g. *mousseline* for *mousseline sauce* / *sauce mousseline*, *ponzu* for *ponzu sauce*, *peel* for *candied peel* or *pin* for *rolling pin*. Such examples illustrate clipping, that is, a process of shortening a word by reducing one or more of its syllables but keeping its meaning (Bauer 1983: 233). Not only single words are subject to clipping, but also compounds and fixed phrases. In this case, *mousseline* and *ponzu* fall into the category of hind clipping, while *pin* and *peel* are instances of fore clipping, which are otherwise dubbed “right-edge monosyllabic clip” and “left-edge monosyllabic clip” respectively (Miller 2014: 176). As diachronic evidence for word-formation processes is not always readily available, we may take a closer

look at the formation of clippings such as *peel* (for *candied peel*) and *pin* (for *rolling pin*).

The variation between *peel* and *candied peel* is traced, in the first place, to cookery books. Once ingredients are listed for a recipe, they are often referred to in the ensuing text in a shortened form, either with or without the definite article. In Mrs Beeton's *Book of Household Management* (1863), for instance, there is a reference to *peel* (= *candied peel*):

LEMON MINCEMEAT. INGREDIENTS: 2 large lemons, 6 large apples, ½ lb/. of suet, 1 lb. of currants, ½ lb. of sugar, 2 oz. of **candied lemon-peel**, 1 oz. of citron, mix spice to taste. *Mode*: – Pare the lemons, squeeze them, and boil the peel until tender enough to mash. Add to the mashed lemon-peel the apples, which should be pared, cored, and minced; the chopped suet, currants, sugar, sliced **peel** and spice: *The Book of Household Management* (p. 651-2)

A comparable situation can be noticed in the following citation, which helps antedate the earliest occurrence of *peel* in OED3 from 1869 to 1821:

Candied orange, or lemon peel. *Soak Seville orange peel, well cleaned from the pulp in several waters, till it loses its bitterness*; cut it into thin slips, simmer them in a syrup composed of two parts, by weight, of lump sugar, and one of water [...] and continue the simmering till the sugar candles about the pot and **peel**: *Culinary Chemistry: Exhibiting the Scientific Principles of Cookery* (p. 256-57)

The same is observed in the cookery sense of *pin* (= *rolling pin*). The extract below is an expanded version of the passage from *The History of Johnny Quae Genus: The Little Foundling of the Late Doctor Syntax* (1822), OED3's earliest attestation for *pin*:

While, from her knee unto her chin,
She wav'd the floured **rolling pin**.
(...)
And each was gone where duty call'd,
He, with a pressing arm, embrac'd
The busy cook's well-fatten'd waist,
As with her **pin** she plied the paste;

As for the second chronological citation, which is dated to 1894 in OED3 ("Keep the board and pin well floured"), one can find a parallel usage in an earlier source: "Another Puff Paste. Make nearly all of the flour into a stiff paste with cold water (...) flatten it a little with the **rolling-pin**, and then roll it out, dusting the paste and the **pin** with flour before and after

rolling”: *The Practice of Cookery: Adapted to the Business of Every Day Life* (1830, p. 232).

OED3’s quotation from *Tri-City Herald* of 21 November 1957, in a fuller form, reads as follows: “Place the **rolling pin** across one half the circle and flip one side of the pastry circle over the **pin**. Transfer pastry to one side of the pizza pan and unroll pastry over the pan” (p. 17). It is worth mentioning that the same recipe appeared a week before in *The Monroe News-Star* of 14 November 1957 (p. 36) and a day before in *The Times* of 20 November 1957 (p. 46).¹³

As can be seen above, the clipped forms are invariably used within the same context as the full forms. This suggests that, by referring to the full forms (the referents) used earlier in the text, the clippings function as cohesive devices. Obviously, they are not anaphoric in the strict sense of the term – in most cases of anaphora, a pronoun refers back to a noun phrase (see, e.g., Halliday and Hasan 1976: 33; Brown 1983: 199-201) – but they can nevertheless be regarded as components of a referential process.

3.6. Labelling

To my surprise, a number of words labelled *Cookery* were not retrieved automatically from OED3. *Moo goo gai pan* (see below) is among those of the lemmas which did not find their way into my research sample.

moo goo gai pan, *n.* *Cookery.* A Chinese dish consisting of stir-fried strips of chicken with mushrooms and assorted vegetables.

Such failures seemed hard to account for, but John Simpson pointed out (e-mail of 15 May 2010) that the label in OED3 occurs within the tagged field ‘definition’ for a subsense, not the main (or only) sense. A related search type, ‘search in label’, operates only on specific labels. In order to obtain fully reliable results, that is, all the headwords and senses labelled *Cookery*, one should apply both the ‘search in definition’ and ‘search in label’ functions in OED3’s advanced search module.

Another problem is that a proportion of OED3’s headwords have not been labelled at all. More exactly, as many as 150 entries in the revised alphabet range include *cooking* as part of their definitions (see *Schabzieger* below); the keyword is the only marker of the field of cookery. Worse still, OED3 records names of dishes which are clearly related to the semantic field, but the relation is not signalled formally in any way. The headword *meringue* is a handy example.

¹³ This evidence comes from the text archive of Newspapers.com.

- (eds.), *Sounds, words, texts and change. Selected papers from 11 ICEHL, Santiago de Compostela, 7-11 September 2000*, 65-81. Vol. 2. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Durkin, P. 2004. Loanword etymologies in the third edition of the *OED*: some questions of classification. In C. Kay et al. (eds.), *New perspectives on English historical linguistics: selected papers from 12 ICEH, Glasgow, 21-26 August 2002*, 79-90. Vol. 2, *Lexis and transmission*. Amsterdam-Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Gilliver, P. 2005. Materials and methodologies for the new *Oxford English Dictionary*. In H. Gottlieb, J.E. Mogensen and A. Zettersten (eds.), *Symposium on lexicography XI. Proceedings of the eleventh international symposium on lexicography May 2-4, 2002 at the University of Copenhagen*, 241-248. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag.
- Google Books. Online at <<https://books.google.com/>>.
- Google Books Corpus. Online at <<http://googlebooks.byu.edu>>.
- Halliday, M. and R. Hasan 2013. *Cohesion in English* [Reprint of the 1976 edition]. Abingdon-New York: Routledge.
- HathiTrust. Online at <<http://www.hathitrust.org/>>.
- Ilson, R.F. 1986. *Lexicography: an emerging international profession*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Kay, C.J., and I. Wotherspoon 2002. Turning the dictionary inside out: some issues in the compilation of a historical thesaurus. In J.E. Díaz Vera (ed.), *A changing world of words: studies in English historical lexicography, lexicology and semantics*, 109-135. Amsterdam-New York: Rodopi.
- McConchie, R.W. 1997. *Lexicography and physicke. The record of sixteenth-century English medical terminology*. Oxford Studies in Lexicography and Lexicology. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Miller, D.G. 2014. *English lexicogenesis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Newspapers.com. Online at <<http://www.newspapers.com/>>.
- Piotrowski, T. 2009. Annoyed because of eternity. Approximate and exact historical lexicography. In R. Wolny (ed.), *On time: reflections on aspects of time in culture, literature and language*, 197-203. Opole: Uniwersytet Opolski.
- Podhajecka, M. 2011. Research in historical lexicography: can Google Books collection complement traditional corpora? In S. Gózdź-Roszkowski (ed.), *Practical applications in language and computers*, 529-546. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- OED = *The Oxford English Dictionary. The New English Dictionary on Historical Principles*. First edition, 1884-1928 (eds.) J. Murray et al. Supplement, 1933. Supplement, 1972-1986, (ed.) R. Burchfield. Second edition, 1989 (eds.) J. Simpson and E. Weiner. Third edition, 2000-2013 (ed.) J. Simpson; 2013-. M. Proffitt. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Online at <<http://dictionary.oed.com>>.
- Schäfer, J. 1980. *Documentation in the OED: Shakespeare and Nashe as test cases*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Schäfer, J. 1989. *Early Modern English lexicography. Vol. 2. Additions and corrections to the OED*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Simpson, J. 2000. Distractions. Preface to the third edition. Online at <<http://public.oed.com/the-oed-today/preface-to-the-third-edition-of-the-oed/>>.
- Simpson, J. 2004. The OED and collaborative research into the history of English. *Anglia* 122: 185-208.

- Simpson, J. 2011. *Writing the OED* [Transcript of the recording]. Online at <<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=v9AgtJTVuuM&list=PL07253E5BE6882EC9&index=17>>.
- Simpson, J., E. Weiner and P. Durkin 2004. The *Oxford English Dictionary* today. *Transactions of the Philological Society* 102(3): 335-381.
- ten Hacken, P. 2012. *In what sense is the OED the definitive record of the English language?* In R.V. Fjeld and J.M. Torjusen (eds.), *Proceedings of the 15th EURALEX International Congress, 7-11 August 2012*, 834-845. Oslo: Department of Linguistics and Scandinavian Studies, University of Oslo.
- The Internet Archive. Online at <<https://archive.org/>>.
- Weiner, E. 2009. The electronic OED: the computerization of a historical dictionary. In A.P. Cowie (ed.), *The Oxford history of English lexicography*, 378-409. Vol. 1. General purpose-dictionaries. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Willinsky, J. 1994. *Empire of words. The reign of the OED*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Google Books sources

- A Complete System of Cookery, in Which is Set Forth a Variety of Genuine Receipts, Collected from Several Years Experience...* (1759)
- Angola and the River Congo*, v. 2 (1875)
- Anne Lindsay's Light Kitchen* (2008)
- Apicius Redivivus, or, the Cook's Oracle* (1817)
- A Surgeon's World: An Autobiography* (1943)
- Chamber's Edinburgh Journal*, 13 (1850)
- Culinary Chemistry: Exhibiting the Scientific Principles of Cookery* (1821)
- Dairying Exemplified, or, The Business of Cheese-Making* (1784)
- Das Ausland: Eine Wochenschrift für Kunde des geistigen und sittlichen Lebens der Völker* (1839)
- East for Pleasure: The Narrative of Eight Months' Travel in Burma, Siam, the Netherlands East Indies and French Indo-China* (1929)
- Domestic Manners and Customs of the Hindoos of Northern India, or, More Strictly Speaking, of the North West Provinces of India*, ed. 2 (1866)
- Eau Claire Dec. 24* (1911)
- French Domestic Cookery, Combining Economy with Elegance, and Adapted to the Use of Families of Moderate Fortunes ...* (1825)
- Gazetteer of the Bombay Presidency*, 21 (1884)
- Homemade Christmas cookies* (2003)
- How to Dine, Dinners & Dining with Bills of Fare for All the Year* (1866)
- Indian Cookery Local for Young Housekeepers* (1887)
- Islam in India, or, the Qānūn-i-Islām; the Customs of the Musalmāns of India; Comprising a Full and Exact Account of Their Various Rites and Ceremonies from the Moment of Birth to the Hour of Death* (1921)
- Journal of the Franklin Institute*, 6 (1) (1828)
- Key to the Japanese Conversation-Grammar* (1905)
- La cuisine classique études pratiques, raisonnées et démonstratives ...* (1856)
- La Gastronomie en Russie* (1860)
- Narrative of a Forced Journey through Spain and France, as a Prisoner of War, in the Years 1810 to 1814* (1814)

- Narrative of Various Journeys in Balochistan, Afghanistan, and the Panjab, Including a Residence in Those Countries from 1826 to 1838*, vol. 3 (1842)
- New York Magazine*, 10(27) (1977)
- New York Magazine*, 11(41) (1978)
- New York Magazine*, 12(35) (1979)
- Outdoor Cooking* (1940)
- Outside Inn* (1920)
- Pacific Hotels and Transportation Services* (1962)
- Paterson's National Benefit: A Treatise on How to Propagate and Cultivate Potatoes* (1872)
- Personal Narrative of a Pilgrimage to El-Madinah and Meccah* (1856)
- Philippine Magazine*, 23 (1926)
- Seventy-Five Receipts for Pastry, Cakes and Sweetmeats* (1836)
- Sikeston Standard* Aug. 20 (1935)
- Sun and Shadow in Spain* (1908)
- The Accounting* (1958)
- The All-New Complete Cooking Light Cookbook* (2006)
- The Angler's Note-Book and Naturalist's Record: A Repertory of Fact, Inquiry and Discussion on Field-Sports and Subjects of Natural History* (1880)
- The art of dinner giving and usages of polite society* (1880)
- The Catholic World* (1867)
- The Chicago Herald Cooking School: A Professional Cook's Book for Household Use, Consisting of a Series of Menus for Every Day Meals and for Private Entertainments, with Minute Instructions for Making Every Article Named ...* (1883)
- The Complete Idiot's Guide to Throwing a Great Party* (2000)
- The Complete Modern Cook, Containing a Very Extensive and Original Collection of Recipes in Cookery ...* (1834)
- The Cook's Dictionary, and House-Keeper's Directory: A New Family Manual of Cookery and Confectionary ...* (1830)
- The Cook's Dictionary, and Housekeeper's Directory: A New Family Manual of Cookery and Confectionary ...* (1832)
- The Cook's Dictionary, and Housekeeper's Directory: A New Family Manual of Cookery and Confectionary ...* (1833)
- The Cook's Oracle: Containing Receipts for Plain Cookery* (1822)
- The Cook's Own Book: An American Family Cook Book Containing More Than Twenty-five Hundred Receipts for Cooking Every Kind of Meat, Fish, and Fowl ...* (1885)
- The Face in the Aspice: Tales of Club Life Among the Overfed* (1944)
- The Family Receipt-Book, or, Universal Repository of Useful Knowledge and Experience in All the Various Branches of Domestic Oeconomy (ca. 1810)*
- The Female Economist, or a Plain System of Cookery: For the Use of Families* (1810)
- The Freaks of Cupid, by an Irish Bachelor* (1845)
- The French Cook*, ed. 7 (1822)
- The French Cook: A System of Fashionable and Economical Cookery ...* (1829)
- The French Cook, or the Art of Cookery Developed in All Its Various Branches*, ed. 3 (1815)
- The Gourmet's Guide to Europe* (1911)
- The Journal of Geology*, 6(7) (1898)
- The History of Johnny Quae Genus: The Little Foundling of the Late Doctor Syntax* (1822)

- The Kingdom and People of Siam* (1857)
The Lady's Assistant for Regulating and Supplying Her Table (1777)
The Modern Cook: A Practical Guide to the Culinary Art in All its Branches (1846)
The Nation: A Weekly Journal Devoted to Politics, Literature, Science and Art 8 (1869)
The New Practice of Cookery, Pastry, Baking, and Preserving (1804)
The New Yorker, 25 (1949)
The New-York Magazine, 6 (1795)
The Pioneers of Beverly: Series of Sketches (1889)
The Practice of Cookery: Adapted to the Business of Every Day Life (1830)
The Professed Cook; Or, the Modern Art of Cookery, Pastry, & Confectionary ... (1812)
The Royal Parisian Pastrycook and Confectioner (1834)
The Single Handed Cook: More Recipes (1904)
The Steward's Handbook and Guide to Party Catering, ed. 6 (1903)
The Treasury of French Cookery (1866)
The Wheels of Fashion (1965)
Time's Telescope for 1828, or, a Complete Guide to the Almanack ... (1828)
Tri-City Herald (1957)
Two Hundred and Nine Days (1827)
Unknown Switzerland: Reminiscences of Travel (1914)
Week in a Day (2013)

Appendix 1. The list of cooking terms or senses in the research sample

madeleine	naan	parcel	Portugaise
magirolology	nam pla	pao-tzu	porchetta
magirolologist	nam prik	parsley green	potato ball
make-ahead	Napoletana	pasta 1	potato latke
marble veal	nasi	pastilla	poule au riz
mark 1	nasi beryani	pâté 3	poulette, ¹⁴
Maryland	nasi goreng	peel 3	poussin
masala	nasi Padang	pesto	pressure cookery
medallion	nixtamal	petite marmite	pulse 2
meze	Nonya	petit poussin	purse
microwave	nuoc man	pièce montée	puttanesca
minceur	olykoek	pig iron	quesadilla
mirin	omochi	pin 1	rabbit-stock
mise en place	onglet	pirozhok	raclette
mizutaki	pain au chocolat	pithivier	raft 1
mock brawn	pain de campagne	poached egg	ramen
molecular gastronomy	pain de mie	poffertje	rasam
momo 1	palmier	polonaise	ras malai
money bag	palourde	polpetta	rassolnik
monsieur	pan drippings	pol sambol	reamer
Montpellier butter	pan juices	pomme te terre	reaming
morita 2	panada	pomodoro	recipe book
moskonfyt	pancake turner	ponzu	reduction
mousseline	panko	poppadom	

¹⁴ The 1803 antedating for *poulette* is not displayed in the citations paragraph, but it illustrates the use of the headword in the etymology section.

Appendix 2. Antedatings from Google Books incorporated into OED3¹⁵

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	OED3's headword	Antedated from > to
madeleine	1845 > 1829	pancake turner	1850 > 1673 ¹⁶
make-ahead	1961 > 1960	pao-tzu	1944 > 1927
marble veal	1789 > 1769	parcel (2)	1981 > 1941
Maryland	1894 > [1858]	pasta	1874 > [1827]
medallion	1907 > 1806	pastilla (3)	1857 > 1834
mirin	1880 > 1874	petite marmite	1900 > 1890
mise en place	1948 > 1876	petit poussin (2)	1900 > [1894]
mizutaki	1964 > 1937	pièce montée	1858 > [1822]
momo 1	1924 > 1922	pig iron	1756 > 1732
money bag	1993 > 1986	pirozhok	1912 > 1887
Montpellier butter (2)	1889 > [1822]	pithivier (3)	1902 > [1810]
mousseline	1907 > 1876	poached egg (3)	[1927] > [1769]
nam pla	1955 > 1931	poffertje (2)	1872 > 1804
nam prik	1897 > 1857	polonaise	1889 > 1834
Napoletana	1990 > 1950	polpetta	1839 > 1822
nasi beryani	1971 > 1963	pomme de terre	1797 > 1789 ¹⁷
nasi goreng	1938 > 1924	pomodoro (2)	1860 > 1842
nixtamal	1902 > 1896	porchetta	1953 > 1929
nuoc man	1919 > [1847]	potato ball (2)	1823 > [1777]
olykoek (2)	1809 > [1740]	poule au riz (2)	1882 > 1825
omochi	1956 > 1899	poussin (2)	1922 > 1883
onglet (2)	1983 > [1975]	pressure cookery	1921 > [1918]
pain au chocolat	1945 > 1944	pulse 2	1977 > 1971
pain de campagne	1979 > 1970	puttanesca (2)	1972 > 1970
pain de mie	1977 > 1905	quesadilla	1857 > 1849
palmier	1929 > 1920	raclette	1949 > 1914
palourde	1861 > 1823	rassolnik	1924 > 1899
pan juices	1944 > 1914	reduction	1844 > 1815

¹⁵ The number in round brackets stands for the number of antedatings taken into OED3.

¹⁶ *Pancake turner* was further antedated to the first edition of Randle Cotgrave's dictionary (1611).

¹⁷ The lexicographers succeeded in antedating this citation for *pomme de terre* to 1776.

Appendix 3. Additional antedatings for OED3's cooking terms in Google Books¹⁸

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	Source
macaroni cheese	1877 > 1846	Vegetables. Chicken Celery, Boiled Rice, Macaroni Cheese, Cole-slaw, Chicken Salad: <i>Milwaukee Daily Sentinel and Gazette</i> , 30 Dec. (p. 7)
mouqueca	1980 > 1875	Cold fried-fish is equally good for making a “ muqueca ,” which is always served at table in the frying-pan, or, better still, flat earthen pan in which it has been cooked: <i>Angola and the River Congo</i> , v. 2 (p. 240)
	1980 > 1880	It is described by Mr. Monteior in his “Angola” (1875), as being “very delicious,” and in common use on the coast of Africa, where it is called “ Muqueca ”: <i>The Angler's Note-Book and Naturalist's Record: A Repertory of Fact, Inquiry and Discussion on Field-Sports and Subjects of Natural History</i> (p. 22)
magret de canard	1980 > 1977	The sauce tasted for all the world like liquefied bouillon cubes, utterly drowning the flavor of that magret de canard : <i>New York Magazine</i> , 10(27) (p. 34)
	1980 > 1978	It is also doubtful that magret de canard – the splendid duck steak served rare in France – can be more than hinted at, given the anatomy of our local ducks, though Raphael's magret scented with honey vinegar (\$18.50) definitely pleases: <i>New York Magazine</i> , 11(41) (p. 79)
	1980 > 1979	Fresh currants in the chill of winter, imported from New Zealand to grace the magret de canard – rare duck breast in a cassis-scented, vinegar-spiked sauce: <i>New York Magazine</i> , 12(35) (p. 63)
meringue Chantilly	1901 > 1880	Pudding Neselrode, Meringue Chantilly , Petits fours: <i>The Art of Dinner Giving and Usages of Polite Society</i> (p. 100)
		Mince Pie, Meringue à la crème de Chantilly , Pumpkin Pie: <i>The Art of Dinner Giving and Usages of Polite Society</i> (p. 122)

¹⁸ The antedatings for *macaroni cheese* and *Strasbourgaise* come from Newspapers.com.

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	Source
		Corbeille de meringue à la Chantilly , Gold-leaf jelly au Dantzic: <i>The Art of Dinner Giving and Usages of Polite Society</i> (p. 125)
mince	1804 > 1759	For this you should draw your cocks, cut off the feet, and truss the thighs in; preserve the ropes for the forcemeat, and make a little mince of your livers, with a morsel of ham, seasoned with a mushroom, pepper, salt and parsley.: <i>A Complete System of Cookery, in Which is Set Forth ...</i> (p. 134)
mirepoix	1877 > 1815	When that is done put your meat, that has been prepared as above, into the mirepoix : <i>The French Cook...</i> , ed. 3 (p. 159)
	1877 > 1829	Fowl à la Mirepoix , otherwise à la Cendre . Truss the fowl as in No. 311. Next make a mirepoix without its being melted, that is to say, scrape some bacon, a little butter, a few slices of ham, with a little thyme, bay-leaves, salt, and pepper: <i>The French Cook: A System of Fashionable and Economical Cookery...</i> (p. 141-142)
	1877 > 1846	Stew the carp in a mirepoix of white wine, when done, drain and dish it up; pour some <i>Provençale</i> sauce over it, garnish it with groups of muscles fried in batter, and scallops of perch, tossed in green <i>ravigotte</i> sauce; place a border of cray-fish round the dish, and send to table: <i>The Modern Cook: A Practical Guide to the Culinary Art in All its Branches</i> (p. 139)
Napoleon pastry	1969 > 1883	Napoleon pastry (Menu no. VI – RECEPTION): <i>The Chicago Herald Cooking School ...</i> (p. 119)
	1969 > 1965	Their work began anew everytime the cut goods, layered like gigantic Napoleon pastries , arrived by truck from Sportwhirl: <i>The Wheels of Fashion</i> (p. 14)
natilla	1969 > 1828	For milk porridge, “ natilla ,” take a quarter of a pound of fecula, and dissolve it in a sufficient quantity of cold milk, (that of almonds is preferable, in the case of sickness) the lumps must be well mashed: <i>Journal of the Franklin Institute</i> , 6 (1) (p. 389)

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	Source
	1969 > 1908	(...) saddle of veal larded and and roasted with aromatic herbs and manzanilla, rice boiled in cream with the name of the best guest at each table traced in powdered cinnamon, <i>natilla</i> , a wonderful kind of cream, and <i>ojaldres</i> , – a sort of pastry, light and brittle as a butterfly's wing, which they eat with chocolate: <i>Sun and Shadow in Spain</i> (p. 186)
palacsinta	1969 > 1943	All about there swirled the savory odors of frying <i>palacsinta</i> and <i>pörköllt</i> , and everywhere the essence of the grape flowed as swiftly and almost as ceaselessly as the Danube winding through the town: <i>A Surgeon's World: An Autobiography</i> (p. 35)
	1969 > 1949	Then, contrarily, she pushed toward Hester a plateful of <i>palacsinta</i> – thin pancakes stuffed with sweetened cottage cheese or melted jelly, which she would never make on command but which would appear suddenly when she had been moved: <i>The New Yorker</i> , 25 (p. 30)
palak	1868 > 1842	About the middle of February wild ducks and sparrows were exposed for sale in the bazars, and shortly afterwards pālak , or spinach, was procurable, with the tender shoots of the fish plant, here employed as vegetables, and gathered from the sun-exposed skirts of the hills: <i>Narrative of Various Journeys in Balochistan, Afghanistan, and the Panjab...</i> (p. 4-5)
	1868 > 1866	We have common potatoes, sweet potatoes (...) cabbages, carrots, radishes, egg-plants, tamatoes, (not extensively raised, because not used by natives) turnips, ghooians, soa, methee, chauláee, pālak , marsá, cucumbers of two kinds, (kheera and kakree) tooroees, laukees, (both of the cucumber tribes) gourds, and some others: <i>Domestic Manners and Customs of the Hindoos of Northern India...</i> (p. 47)
pancake breakfast	1923 > 1889	Scrap iron collection, pancake breakfast at Rockton Fair, turkey shoot, raffles, bingo, sale of charcoal, donkey baseball: <i>The Pioneers of Beverly: Series of Sketches</i> (p. 289)

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	Source
pancake-like	1887 > 1845	Suddenly, a desperate commotion is visible – the noses become more pancake-like than ever, and the eyes seem fairly darting from their sockets, as a travelling chariot, whirled along by four magnificent bays, comes flying down the street: <i>The Freaks of Cupid, by an Irish Bachelor</i> (p. 423).
pommes allumettes	1962 > 1944	They never cut <i>pommes allumettes</i> the exact size between French-fried and julienne: <i>The Face in the Aspic: Tales of Club Life Among the Overfed</i> (p. 144)
	1962 > 1958	Huge, browned and shiny with gravy, heaped with pommes allumettes and petits pois, it was carried...: <i>The Accounting</i> (p. 47)
pumpkin-chip	1837 > 1836	Weigh them, and allow to each pound of pumpkin chips , a pound of loaf-sugar: <i>Seventy-Five Receipts for Pastry, Cakes and Sweetmeats</i> (p. 90)
pumpkin soup	1830 > 1812	Potage à la Citrouille. Pumpkin Soup . CUT the pumpkin in such a manner as you may join it again handsomely; take out all the seeds, and half of the flesh (which you may do easily with a table spoon): <i>The Professed Cook; Or, the Modern Art of Cookery, Pastry, & Confectionary...</i> (p. 26)
	1830 > 1825	Pumpkin Soup . Pare the rind from a quarter of a middle-sized pumpkin, and take out the inside, then cut it in smallish pieces, and boil it in water till it becomes of the consistence of marmalade, all the water being consumed: <i>French Domestic Cookery ...</i> (p. 16)
quiche	1925 > [1828]	At <i>Commercy</i> , in the ci-devant Lorraine, during the <i>Rogation week</i> , religious processions are made in the fields; and, at this period of the year, a little fair is held for the sale of <i>tarts</i> and cakes; hence, the fair is not only called Rogation-Fair Day, but the day or fair of Quichottes, the diminutive of Quiche , which signifies, in the language of the country, a <i>tart</i> , or small piece of pastry: <i>Time's Telescope for 1828...</i> (p. 117)

OED3's headword	Antedated from > to	Source
	1925 > 1867	The town is now famous chiefly for the production of some excellent cakes with the quaint name of " <i>quiches</i> ," probably only a corruption of German Kuchlein: <i>The Catholic World</i> (p. 523)
shiso	1924 > 1905	Besides, they like in Japan to eat together with sake so-called appetising things – as, for instance, trout, salted bonito, sea-hedgehog, the salted viscera of the trepang; as for vegetable, salted plums, small plums, <i>shiso</i> , <i>yukari</i> , and so on, a little of each: <i>Key to the Japanese Conversation-Grammar</i> (p. 39)
Strasbourgaise	1969 > 1911	A man could satisfy his hunger on "Saddle of English venison," "Imported Russian Prairie Chicken," "Roast Wild Turkey," and "French Grouse en Voliere," with a few trifles like "Aspic de Foie Gras Strasbourgaise " and "Pate of Game a la Parisienne": <i>Eau Claire Dec. 24</i> (p. 4)
	1969 > 1935	On board the S. S. Manhattan, where "pate de foie gras en gelee, Strasbourgaise " is practically the passengers' daily bread, the most popular appetizers of all are those which are most familiar to us, and which we can readily serve at home...: <i>Sikeston Standard Aug. 20</i> (p. 6)